

Notice of Allowability

Application No.

10/733,584

Examiner

Cheyne D. Ly

Applicant(s)

GRASSO ET AL.

Art Unit

2168

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to December 14, 2006.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 1-5, 8-14, and 17-19 (renumbered as 1-15).
3. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some* c) ☐ None of the:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* Certified copies not received: _____.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application.

THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.

4. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
5. ☐ CORRECTED DRAWINGS (as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
- (a) ☐ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) attached
- 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☐ to Paper No./Mail Date _____.
- (b) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No./Mail Date _____.
- Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the header according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).
6. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 5. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| 2. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 6. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413),
Paper No./Mail Date <u>February 26, 2007</u> . |
| 3. <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statements (PTO/SB/08),
Paper No./Mail Date _____ | 7. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Amendment/Comment |
| 4. <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit
of Biological Material | 8. <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance |
| | 9. <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____ |

EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT

1. An examiner's amendment to the record appears below. Should the changes and/or additions be unacceptable to applicant, an amendment may be filed as provided by 37 CFR 1.312. To ensure consideration of such an amendment, it MUST be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee.
2. Authorization for this examiner's amendment was given in a telephone interview with Jeannette M. Walder (Reg. No. 30,698) on February 26, 2007.
3. The amendment, filed December 14, 2006, has been entered. The Examiner Amendment is directed the entered amendment.
4. The application has been amended as follows:

IN THE CLAIMS

5. **Cancel** claims 7 and 16.
6. Claim 1, line 2, **delete** "items", **insert** therefor —documents—
7. Claim 1, line 3, **delete** "items", **insert** therefor —documents—
8. Claim 1, line 4, **delete** "item", **insert** therefor —document—
9. Claim 1, line 6, **delete** "item", **insert** therefor —document—
10. Claim 1, line 7, **delete** "item", **insert** therefor —document—
11. Claim 1, line 8, after "relevant", **delete** "items", **insert** therefor —documents—
12. Claim 1, line 8, after "produced", **delete** "items", **insert** therefor —documents—
13. Claim 1, line 11, **delete** "items", **insert** therefor —documents—
14. Claim 1, line 13, after "those", **delete** "items", **insert** therefor —documents—
15. Claim 1, line 13, after "authoritative", **delete** "items", **insert** therefor —documents—

16. Claim 1, line 14, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
17. Claim 1, line 15, **delete** “wherein the determining steps comprise”, **insert** therefor, --
wherein the steps of defining the hub experts and authoritative documents comprise—
18. Claim 1, line 18, **remove** quotation marks from “authority” and “hub”
19. Claim 1, line 23, **delete** “.”
20. Claim 1, after line 23, **insert** thereafter –wherein node *I* represents an authoritative
document and node *j* represents a hub expert; and wherein *a* represents an authority value for an
authoritative document and wherein *h* represents a hub value for a hub expert;
generating a list of hub experts associated with the authoritative documents.--
21. Claim 2, line 2, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
22. Claim 3, line 1, **delete** “an item”, **insert** therefor –the document—
23. Claim 3, line 2, after “reading the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
24. Claim 3, line 2, after “reviewing the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
25. Claim 3, line 2, after “commenting on the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
26. Claim 3, line 2, after “recommending the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
27. Claim 4, line 1, **delete** “an item”, **insert** therefor –the document—
28. Claim 5, line 1, **delete** “an item”, **insert** therefor –the document—
29. Claim 9, line 1, **delete** “claim 7”, **insert** therefor –claim 1--
30. Claim 9, line 2, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
31. Claim 9, line 3, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
32. Claim 10, line 3, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
33. Claim 10, line 4, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—

Art Unit: 2168

34. Claim 10, line 6, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
35. Claim 10, line 7, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
36. Claim 10, line 8, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
37. Claim 10, line 8, after “particular field” and before “; and”, **insert** –and have not directly produced documents in the particular field—
38. Claim 10, line 10, after “creating identified”, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor – documents—
39. Claim 10, line 10, after “their identified”, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
40. Claim 10 line 14, **delete** “determining steps comprise:”, **insert** therefor –steps of defining hub experts and authoritative experts comprise:--
41. Claim 10, line 22, **delete** “.”
42. Claim 10, after line 22, **insert** thereafter –wherein node *I* represents an authoritative expert and node *j* represents a hub expert; and
43. wherein *a* represents an authority value for an authoritative expert and wherein *h* represents a hub value for a hub expert;
44. generating a list of hub experts associated with the authoritative experts—
45. Claim 12, line 1, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
46. Claim 12, line 2, after “reading the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
47. Claim 12, line 2, after “reviewing the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
48. Claim 12, line 2, after “on the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
49. Claim 12, line 2, after “recommending the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
50. Claim 13, line 1, **delete** “an item”, **insert** therefor – the document—

Art Unit: 2168

51. Claim 14, line 1, **delete** “an item”, **insert** therefor – the document—
52. Claim 17, line 1, **delete** “claim 16”, **insert** therefor –claim 10—
53. Claim 17, line 2, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
54. Claim 17, line 2, **delete** “e.g.”, **insert** therefor –wherein the ratings—
55. Claim 18, line 1, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
56. Claim 18, line 3, **delete** “itèms”, **insert** therefor –documents—
57. Claim 18, line 4, after “each identified”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
58. Claim 18, line 4, after “ratings for the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
59. Claim 18, line 5, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
60. Claim 18, line 6, **delete** “for”
61. Claim 18, line 6, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
62. Claim 18, line 7, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
63. Claim 18, line 7, **delete** “for”
64. Claim 18, line 8, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
65. Claim 18, line 8, **delete** “for”
66. Claim 18, line 9, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
67. Claim 18, line 10, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
68. Claim 18, line 10, **delete** “for”
69. Claim 18, line 11, **delete** “for”
70. Claim 18, line 11, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
71. Claim 18, line 12, after “experts; and” **delete** “for”
72. Claim 18, line 12, after “defining those” **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—

Art Unit: 2168

73. Claim 18, line 12, after “as authoritative” **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
74. Claim 18, line 12, after “authoritative items and” **delete** “for”
75. Claim 18, line 13, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
76. Claim 18, line 14, **delete** “further for”
77. Claim 18, line 16, **remove** quotation marks from “authority” and “hub”
78. Claim 18, line 19, **delete** “.”
79. Claim 18, after line 19, **insert** thereafter –wherein node *I* represents an authoritative document and node *j* represents a hub expert; and wherein *a* represents an authority value for an authoritative document and wherein *h* represents a hub value for a hub expert;
80. processor generating a list of hub experts associated with the authoritative documents.—
81. Claim 19, line 3, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
82. Claim 19, line 4, after “each identified”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
83. Claim 19, line 4, after “ratings for the”, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
84. Claim 19, line 7, **delete** “for”
85. Claim 19, line 7, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
86. Claim 19, line 8, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
87. Claim 19, line 8, **delete** “for”
88. Claim 19, line 9, **delete** “item”, **insert** therefor –document—
89. Claim 19, line 9, **delete** “for”
90. Claim 19, line 10, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
91. Claim 19, line 11, **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
92. Claim 19, line 12, **delete** “for”

93. Claim 19, line 12, after “creating identified” **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor – documents—
94. Claim 19, line 12, after “their identified” **delete** “items”, **insert** therefor –documents—
95. Claim 19, line 15, **delete** “further for”
96. Claim 19, line 17, **remove** quotation marks from “authority” and “hub”
97. Claim 19, line 19, **delete** “.”
98. Claim 19, after line 19, **insert** thereafter –wherein node *I* represents an authoritative expert and node *j* represents a hub expert; and
99. wherein *a* represents an authority value for an authoritative expert and wherein *h* represents a hub value for a hub expert;
100. generating a list of hub experts associated with the authoritative experts—

REASON FOR ALLOWANCE

101. The following is an examiner’s statement of reasons for allowance:
102. The prior art of record fails to teach or suggest the claimed invention individually or in combination wherein the “the users who have acted upon the identified document are aware of other relevant documents in the particular field and have not directly produced documents in the particular field” as set forth in independent claims 1, 10, 18, and 19.
103. Dependent claims 2-5, 8-14, 16, and 17 being further limiting to the independent claims 1 or 10 are definite, and enabled by the specification are also allowed.
104. The closest prior art, Chang, H., of record describes the learning create customized authority lists. However, Chang, H., does not teach or suggest the limitations cited above as being free of any prior art when read in the claims as a whole.

105. Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance."

CONCLUSION


106. Patent applicants with problems or questions regarding electronic images that can be viewed in the Patent Application Information Retrieval system (PAIR) can now contact the USPTO's Patent Electronic Business Center (Patent EBC) for assistance. Representatives are available to answer your questions daily from 6 am to midnight (EST). The toll free number is (866) 217-9197. When calling please have your application serial or patent number, the type of document you are having an image problem with, the number of pages and the specific nature of the problem. The Patent Electronic Business Center will notify applicants of the resolution of the problem within 5-7 business days. Applicants can also check PAIR to confirm that the problem has been corrected. The USPTO's Patent Electronic Business Center is a complete service center supporting all patent business on the Internet. The USPTO's PAIR system provides Internet-based access to patent application status and history information. It also enables applicants to view the scanned images of their own application file folder(s) as well as general patent information available to the public.

107. For all other customer support, please call the USPTO Call Center (UCC) at 800-786-9199. The USPTO's official fax number is 571-272-8300.

Art Unit: 2168

108. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to C. Dune Ly, whose telephone number is (571) 272-0716. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Friday from 8 A.M. to 4 P.M.

109. If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Tim Vo, can be reached on (571) 272-3642.

C. Dune Ly 
Patent Examiner
3/4/07